The Goals of Analysis are Understanding, Decisions, and Influencing Policy

Gerald Brown Naval Postgraduate School Monterey, CA 93943 <u>ggbrown@nps.edu</u>, <u>http://faculty.nps.edu/gbrown/</u>

"I am not bound to please thee with my answer." Shakespeare, Merchant of Venice 4(1)b

Why are You in OR?

- Love mathematics?
- Enjoy designing algorithms?
- Like to solve puzzles?
- Think it's cool to be called "Professor?"

• Or, do you want to influence policy?

US Navy?

- Bretton Woods accords, 1944
- The US announced a global, liberal trading system that constitutes the heart of the US maritime approach to security. It is based on the free movement in the maritime domain and on the workings of the market.
- The last 70 years have been the most peaceful maritime epoch in recorded history.



Naval Postgraduate School?

- What do we do?
- In OR, we do military OR.
- We are a trusted source of analysis for our government.
- This work has influenced over a trillion US dollars of investment, and saved lives.

Naval Postgraduate School?

 You might optimally design a network, and we might be interested in degrading it, or destroying it.

• We might be concerned that someone else could degrade or destroy our network.

Example Applications

• Replenishment at Sea (US Navy)

- Increase operational presence, save money

Air Tasking (US Air Force)
– Save lives

Replenishment at Sea Planner

The US Navy operates worldwide, and cannot assume access to port facilities.

US Navy is the only navy that can sustain itself deployed at sea virtually indefinitely.

But, Navy ships need fuel, ordnance, and dry stores.

We go to our ships to deliver these with underway replenishments.

Replenishment at Sea Planner

| Google Earth | | | | | | | |
|--|------------------------|---|--|---|--|--|-----------------------|
| File Edit View Tools Add | Help | | | | | | |
| * Search | | Y 0 8 4 8 | • • • • | 248 | | | |
| | (frame) | 127. | 1 20 CM | and the second se | Start Start | Sec. 10 | 100-2507 |
| and platter name Math | (searce) | | nam an d | 1 | 1.1 | | and a second |
| pass | Get Directions History | 1000 | A. 194 | All and and | A States | | Thomas . |
| * Places | | 126228 | | 10 mar | | and the second s | 100 m 100 200 |
| # 12 St My Diares | | | | · • | A COL | | California and |
| King Signature in Sour Make sure IO Building Inversion checked | 14 | Margar. | C. | | | | The star |
| · X S Smooran Barris | | A March 1993 | all and the second | Gall day level . | 1 C 3 | 1. San - 1. San | and the second second |
| # 12 S RASP | | 1 Call S. 77023 | Ch Call | A 1005-1 300 | | and the second second | State of the second |
| > IC P Routing Locations | | 2.00 2.00 | 1 4 30 | 1.154 | Film | | Republic Comments |
| R CU Ports | | | 1 2 6 | () have | Company and the second | Summer of the local division of the local di | and the state of the |
| Customer Tracks | | 1 10 1 22 | 1. R. 13 | L Start | and so and the | IN THE ADDRESS OF | and the second second |
| Current CLF Tracks | | 1 Marken Car | 1.111 | | Sector N | E PAT AND - LA | and the second second |
| IV Current CUF Events | | N. C. March S. St. | 2 John March | 1.12 | and the second | | The same of the same |
| | | 1 1 1 1 AM 1 1 | 10110 12 | 1 1 | and the second | A THEFT | ALC: NOT A DOUGLE |
| | | CALCER AND ST | the state of the s | 1000 | and indiana | Ball And Establish | Agt |
| | | | Real A | 1. 10. 510 | at an internet | A CONTRACTOR OF | |
| | | 10,000 | Charles E | 10.81 | Carles 1 2 3 11 - 2 | | And And |
| | | 100 100 5 | 2 2010 | 10 500 10 | A DELLAS DE | | Own () Owner |
| | | 1 34 40 134 | 1 200 20 | SAL CONTRACTOR | a state | | and the second second |
| . III | + + 0* | and the second second | 1-11 - A. | COL COLOR | A SUR 1 | The state | |
| * Lavers | Earth Gallery 20 | DOLD BORDING | Sold Asid | 1000 COM | 10000 | the state of the second | 2018 V |
| ✓ ■ ⊕ Primary Database | | STATES STATES | Same and | (Million - Constant | | | |
| > I P Borders and Labels | | AS REAL OF | Take when it | ALC: NO. | Providence in | 1 | |
| - 🕅 🖬 Places | | Luft. d | | | A CAL PROPERTY | 1 Just | |
| R * Photos | | 10 1.1-1 | The Contraction | | 2 Martin | Harden - | |
| E Foeds | | | | | NEWSTR | 100 M | |
| D D Buildings | | 10.00000000 | 1000 | | 1 S 80 M | advent (| |
| Doten | | | | | Corner and | A SHORE W | |
| Weather | | MININA NO. | | Other | CARLES | | |
| Calery | | | A CONTRACTOR | 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1. 1 | Section and the section of the secti | | |
| Clobal Awareness | | A STATE OF | State of the second | Carlo Land | A BOOM STATE | 13 1 | |
| > Contraction of More | | 10 J J J J J | Stat 52 m | - X | all and the second of the | 1 mille | |
| | | La serve | and the second second | A PACE | and the card | | |
| | | 1 2400000 | | 10 - all | Constant of the | | |
| | | 100 - | Charles Par | | Summe 9 | 2012 GIS Innovatsia | |
| | | KARAKS | The second | Charles a | | © 2012 Google | |
| | | 1 miles | A CONTRACT | - | | P 2012 CIRCON-ME | 1 |
| | | and the second se | Jugar Sta | and the second | 2 | A Arrest Arrest | |
| | | A 18 19 19 | | | The second second | A D READ TO BE IN | |

Replenishment at Sea Planner



Navy Helo pilots operate in all weather and all sea states – this is pretty sporty flying 9,000 ton ships connected close abeam at 20+ knots



- US Air Force uses cargo planes to move personnel as well as cargo
- Keeping personnel out of ground convoys avoids Improvised Explosive Devices
- US Air Force called us and asked

"can you improve our efficiency?"



Rob Dell gets his own executive jet, but has to haul his own bag.



For scale, that's Rob Dell on the C-17 cargo ramp.



Part of our airfield network, used by our aircraft every night.

- It's pretty gratifying to get a letter from a General,
- thanking you for "fixing" things,
- and saving an estimated X casualties, and Y KIA's (fatalities) per month.

Now Back to Our Topic Today

If you track the consequences of (too) much of OR research...

- Immediate consequence is exceedingly rare
- Intermediate-term consequence is rare
- Significant policy change is extremely rare, and usually appears only after longer delays than most analysts can afford

If you track the consequences of much of our research...

 "The fault, dear Brutus, is not in our stars, but in ourselves, that we are underlings." Shakespeare, Julius Caesar 1(2)

• Our scholarly training does not prepare us to influence policy.

Problem and Analysis Types

- This is agnostic about the analysis method(s): simulation, stochastics, optimization, ...
- Prescriptive, Descriptive, Normative

• The goal is influencing policy

Qualifying a Worthy Problem

- How will you solve this problem?
- What is the problem?
- Why is this problem important?
- How is this problem now solved?
- How will you solve this problem?
- How will you know when you have succeeded?

What is the problem?

- The client *never* gives you an unambiguous problem description.
- The client uses vernacular that must be developed into a lexicon of clearly developed terms.
- Often the problem has not been isolated, but its symptoms are evident.
- Sometimes this step is the last.

Often the problem has not been isolated, but its symptoms are evident.



"Well, shoot. I just can't figure it out. I'm movin' over 500 doughnuts a day, but I'm still just barely squeakin' by."

Why is this problem important?

- Is this problem worthy of analysis?
- What is the cost of ignoring it?
- Who owns the solution of this problem?
- Sometimes this step is the last, and that is embarrassing.

How is this problem now solved?

- Rare is the problem not already being solved.
- Thumb rules, marker pens and white boards, spreadsheets, tribal wisdom, ... can be very effective.
- Does the solution change the problem?
- Are there domain limits of an acceptable solution?
- Sometimes this step is the last, and that is embarrassing.

How will you solve this problem?

- This is the fun part, but not the only part of qualifying a problem.
- Is the path to solution clear, or is this new ground?

• Sometimes this step is the last, and that can be embarrassing.

How will you know when you have succeeded?

- Recall, we're answering all these qualifying questions *BEFORE* commencing analysis.
- Set the bar for success a priori, and be wary of anybody moving it (up or down).
- Sometimes this step is the last, and when it isn't, this can be embarrassing.

Why Not Brief An "Optimal" Solution?

- Is the "why" as clear as the "what?"
- Is the solution intuitive, or magic?
- Does this solution "change everything?"
- Is this solution fragile, or robust?
- Will the client still be in charge?
- Moderation is a virtue.

Good Reasons for Less Than "Optimal" Advice

- Understandable.
- Actionable.
- Legal.
- Persistent.
- Monotonic.
- Robust.
- Resilient.

Understandable

- Good luck convincing a decision maker to adopt a policy that is not understandable
- Sometimes you need to introduce a solution incrementally
- Sometimes you need to demonstrate with many examples

Actionable

- The solution must be in the domain of the permitted
- Or, you many be suggesting replacing a worthy problem

by another, harder one

Actionable

We suggested really efficient launch schedules for the US Air Force Space Command, but neglected some essential details.



Actionable

Non-intuitive answers can be a challenge to explain.

We discovered a single key component for a first nuclear weapon that could be interdicted. This was not on anybody's "critical path."



Interdict a Non-Critical Activity

Legal

- See "Actionable"
- This comes up more often that we'd like

Persistent

Expect resistance if an answer suggests a wholesale scramble of pre-existing, announced decisions.

| | Weeks | | | | | | | | | | | | | Weeks | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|--------------------|-------------|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|----|-------------------------------|----|-------------|-------------------|----|--------|-----|------|----|----|--------------|------|-----|--------|----|----|
| Cutter | 4 0 | 41 | 42 | 43 | 44 | 45 | 46 | 47 | 48 | 49 | 50 | 51 | 52 | 40 | 41 | 42 | 43 | 44 | 45 | 46 | 47 | 48 | 49 | 50 | 51 | 52 |
| | Revision with CutS | | | | | | | | | | Revision with persistent CutS | | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Adak Wrangell Sanibel Monomoy Jefferson Grand Bainbridge Pt-Bonita Pt-Francis Pt-Jackson Pt-Hannon Pt-Turner Pt-Wells Penobscot Sturgeon Thunder | | Д Д Д | | | | Δ | | | | | | | ∆ ∆ ∆ | | δ | δ δ | his | s is | n | ot | δ δ οp | otiı | 'na | δ δ | δ | |
| | | | | | | | | | | | | | | but is persistent | | | | | | | | | | | | |

Monotonic

 As a budget increases, optimal incremental investments do not necessarily appear monotonically

• A1; A1,A2; A1,B1; A1,A2,A3; B1,B2; ...

• This drives policy types nuts.

Monotonic



Optimal vs. Prioritized (Monotonic) Attacks

Resilient



Robust



Combining Everything

The best executive summary

- Is 3-10 pages long employs simple graphics with technical
- legends

(see Scientific American, or American Scientist)

Combining Everything

The best executive presentation is 5-10 slides in length and includes a "Money Slide"

Money Slide



Why are You in OR?

- Love mathematics?
- Enjoy designing algorithms?
- Like to solve puzzles?
- Think it's cool to be called "Professor?"

• Or, do you want to influence policy?

Questions?

Full background materials:

http://faculty.nps.edu/gbrown/

Copy of this presentation or correspondence:

ggbrown@nps.edu

• "I can no other answer make, but, thanks, and thanks." Shakespeare, 12-th Night 3(3)